The integration of urban fabric potential in the development of Mangiran Market to Fulfil the Indonesian traditional market standard project

Nicolaus Nino Ardiansyah1*, Trias Mahendarto3*, Agnes Gracia Quita3

1,2 Department of Architecture, Faculty of Engineering, Universitas Atma Jaya Yogyakarta
3 Department of Management, Universitas Atma Jaya Yogyakarta

ARTICLE INFO

Article history:
Received November 13, 2023
Received in revised form Jan. 16, 2024
Accepted February 08, 2024
Available online April 01, 2024

Keywords:
Indonesian National Standard
Mangiran market
Traditional market
Urban fabric

*Corresponding author: Nicolaus Nino Ardiansyah
Department of Architecture, Faculty of Engineering, Universitas Atma Jaya Yogyakarta, Indonesia
Email: nino.ardiansyah@uajy.ac.id
ORCID: https://orcid.org/0000-0001-9427-5213

ABSTRACT

The revitalisation of traditional market was prioritized by the Indonesian government to protect the unique socio-cultural space. This was achieved through a set of national standards designed to have a more organized and effective infrastructure to meet contemporary requirements. However, only a few have been able to comply with this high standard required. One of the distinct traditional markets without the capacity to fulfil the standards is Mangiran because of the limitations of the area. Therefore, this research investigated an alternative approach to integrate the urban fabric potential into the Mangiran market for the purpose of fulfilling the required standards. The approach was sued to review the national standard in order to have a new perspective and interpretation of traditional markets. The review was further assessed by collecting and analysing primary and secondary data using a qualitative method. The result showed that the integration of urban fabric into Mangiran market was advantageous in challenging the area limitation. This was achieved through the introduction of new types of customers to the market by diversifying the function using both tangible and intangible urban fabric potential.

Introduction

Traditional market and position in urban fabric of the city

In Indonesian regulation, traditional market is defined as a fixed location containing several shops, markets, booths, or other forms designed for people to buy and sell through a bargaining process and under specific management (Badan Standarisasi Nasional 2021). Traditional market has been an integral part of development in Indonesia, specifically in Java. It is one of the elements from catur gatra concept derived from the classical Javanese cities to form urban core (Urfan, Aliyah, and Yudana 2021). From an economic perspective, traditional market mainly serves a commercial purpose but also exhibits social uniqueness. This is achieved by operating as a space to enforce regional community cohesion in terms of social and cultural functions (Kim 2014). Moreover, traditional market has a dual role which includes serving as a regional community centre for political function. This is possible due to the opportunity provided to have an independent movement of community members at a certain time and space. From a socio-cultural perspective, the market serves as an entertainment platform for people to enjoy free time in the public space (Uzgören 2021), visit.
without buying groceries, as well as to organize traditional ceremonies and regional festivals.

The size and socio-economic importance of traditional market to surrounding areas showed that it is an integral part of urban fabric. Meanwhile, the concept of urban fabric is the systemic organization of constant elements that confirms the relationship between a building and its surroundings. These elements include the plot, the street, the constructed space, and the open space (Levy 1999). Moreover, traditional market is a constructed space on a significant plot of land which is easily accessible from the main street(s). It also usually has most of the elements that influence the development of urban fabric in an area. However, surrounding plots are often occupied by additional merchants living close to the market when there are numerous buyers. An example is the development of Beringharjo market in Yogyakarta, where surrounding area is historically occupied by Chinese and local merchants (Kurniawan et al. 2023). The trend shows that traditional market is very important in defining and developing urban fabric in an area. The significant position is the main difference between traditional market and other types.

Mangiran traditional market and connection to the local area

The location and size of traditional market normally provide a sense of identity to the surrounding area. Moreover, the strong connection between place identity and community can lead to social coherence an increase in the sense of community. This subsequently influences the connectedness or relatedness of the people to the place (Hull, Lam, and Vigo 1994). Traditional market is important to the development of national insight to build a future culture that cannot be separated from traditional roots (Prastiyawan, Isbando, and Noviyanti 2020). It is also useful in establishing a network of supply and demand for the local people due to traditional absorption of nearby crops and daily products (Pramudyo 2014). However, traditional market often suffers from a negative stigma that deters customers, specifically the younger generation, from patronising the merchants (Kato, Ota, and Yamashita 2010). It also faces competition from other market typologies, including modern and mini markets that offer the luxury of comfort and proximity to customers. The challenges have led to the decline of most traditional markets, both economically and physically (Malano 2011). Therefore, the Indonesian National Standard (Standar Nasional Indonesia/SNI) was introduced to ensure more professional management and better competition with the modern and digital marketplace (Badan Standarisasi Nasional 2021). This was implemented through the regulation of the technical and managerial aspects of traditional market.

Mangiran market is one of the major traditional markets in Bantul Regency. It is located in Srandakan District which has been designated by Yogyakarta as the centre for economic growth. The built area of the market is estimated at 2,433 m² on a 4,355 m² land adjacent to Srandakan street which is planned to become part of the main routes between YIA Airport and the Yogyakarta area. Moreover, Mangiran is one of the markets with a ‘market day’ schedule in accordance with the Javanese calendar. This allows irregular merchants to sell goods once every five days, leading to a lack of visitors during regular days, in order to avoid daily heavy activities in the market.

Figure 1. The area of Mangiran market

Permanent markets are normally positioned in the front of the market, adjacent to the main road. There are also some heritage elements in the facilities developed during the Dutch colonial rule, specifically the main entrance and the rooftops of the old areas (Ardhiansyah, Sunaryo, and Kirana 2022). Moreover, the buildings in are one storey and most of the stores are open spaces without walls as presented in figure 2. The market is included in the revitalisation plan designed in the district to standardize and solve the current infrastructure problems of markets such as the drainage and buildings. Some parts of the plan have already been implemented but the effort to fulfil SNI regulations is in progress due to the size, existing infrastructure, and location.
The integration of urban fabric potential in the development of Mangiran Market to Fulfil the Indonesian traditional market standard project

Figure 2. Mangiran market commerce atmosphere

The movement of the market to a new area is projected to be counter-productive due to its socio-economic importance to the surrounding area and position in urban fabric. Therefore, this research was conducted to determine an alternative approach to ensure Mangiran market complies with the technical and managerial aspects of national standard through the integration of urban fabric potential in the surrounding area.

Methods

The main objective of this research was to determine an alternative revitalisation approach for Mangiran traditional market to ensure compliance with national standard despite the limitations. Considering the case study, a qualitative analysis method was selected to achieve the objective (Maxwell 2008). This led to the collection of primary data through direct surveys and interviews with the merchants and management of Mangiran market while secondary data were obtained from literature research to supplement the analysis. The data were later analysed and interpreted descriptively and the two hypotheses formulated were compared.

Results and discussion

The Indonesian traditional market standard: the characterization and issues

Traditional market has some advantages over modern shopping centres such as the existence of a bargaining system that allows intimacy and communication between the sellers and the buyers (Ayuningsasi 2010). However, the position of traditional market is increasingly being threatened by the modern markets which have been reported to be more advantageous in terms of quantity, position, opening time, and the overall condition of the building (Malano 2011).

The government of Indonesia published some rules and regulations to standardize traditional market due to its importance to society and role in direct absorption of local products. The intention is to ensure the market competes better with modern and numerous minimarkets around the city. The current national standard is a revised version of the 2015 regulation formulated to standardize the classification of traditional markets according to the number of merchants. Meanwhile, each category has different requirements based on size and facilities.

The main strategic functions of traditional market as stated in the regulation are to (1) become a local economic strength node, (2) contribute to the regional economy, (3) increase job opportunities, (4) provide trading facilities, specifically for micro, small and medium-size merchants, and (5) serve as a reference point for the price of basic commodities needed for the calculation of inflation rate and price stability indicators. It is also needed to (6) increase local revenue, (7) sustain local culture, (8) become the source of the informal economy which is the backbone of the Indonesian economy, and (9) serve as a basis for the prioritization of local culture in public policymaking. Moreover, the standard also regulates eight important principles which include efficiency, effectivity, productivity, accountability, public interest, environmental insight, social responsibility, and public cooperation. These points are important to the definition of the ideal traditional market in the country.

According to the report by the Indonesian Department of Commerce in December 2021, 5,491 of 16,175 traditional markets had experienced a government-supported revitalisation process to conform with national standard but only 53 managed to comply (Timorria 2021). One of the main problems identified was the cost of fulfilling all the necessary requirements. It was also reported that most of the revitalisation budget was spent on the physical repair. However, previous research showed that some of the revitalisation process was not beneficial to all the stakeholders (Fauzi and Firadaus 2018; Fatmawati and Lantu 2017).
Another problem was the lack of space for infrastructure expansion as required.

Mangiran market: The existing situation and revitalisation approach towards the SNI requirements

Several observations were made during the visit to Mangiran market and interviews were conducted with management and merchants. These were further used as points to consider in the physical facilities to ensure compliance of the market to national standard during the revitalisation process. This research showed a lack of important facilities requiring a large space such as parking spaces and green areas because the market was already full of buildings for the merchants. Moreover, there were no empty lots in the close vicinity of the market, limiting the possibility of expansion of the area without extensive capital investment. The comparison between the existing market and the requirements is presented in the following table 1.

### Table 1. Analysis of Mangiran current situation in accordance with national standard

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Criterion</th>
<th>Minimum requirements</th>
<th>Compliance in Magiran</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Merchant trading space</td>
<td>Minimum 2 m² area</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Remeasurig post</td>
<td>Minimum 2 post</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Parking space</td>
<td>Proportional with the market area size</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Loading area</td>
<td>Available</td>
<td>Only easily available at market in the front</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Vehicle access to the market</td>
<td>Available</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Gangway width</td>
<td>Minimum 1,5m</td>
<td>The circulation area is not distributed evenly</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Management office</td>
<td>Available within the market</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Location of public toilet and bathroom</td>
<td>Minimum</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Number of toilets and wash basin</td>
<td>Available</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Toilet for disabled</td>
<td>Available</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Low-temperature storage</td>
<td>Available</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Mangiran market was divided into two, including the groceries zone consisting of meat, seasonings, spices, and vegetables as well as the daily supplies zone with clothes, snacks, market snacks, pots, and brooms. There is a permanent space at the front to reduce the hygiene problem which has become a negative stigma for traditional markets. The prayer room and bathroom are also observed to be adequate for the current number of market users. However, some problems such as leakages prevent the market from functioning optimally due to the disruptions caused during buying and selling. There is also imperfect drainage caused by the location of the market on a lower terrain compared to the surrounding environment. At the time of the survey, the channels of the drainage system were being repaired and infiltration wells constructed.

In addition to the building aspect, the management of Mangiran market is under the authority of Bantul Regional Development Planning Agency (Bappeda Bantul). The maintenance and operations are normally supported by subsidies from the local government and market rental fees. Surrounding community also earns income and livelihood through fees obtained from parking spaces. However, the income from rentals is very low and limited because the market is active only on traditional Javanese day. This shows that most of the operational costs are covered by government subsidies. Another observation is that there is a limited number of personnel on the market.
management positions. This is evident in the fact that the individuals managing Mangiran market are also in charge of two other traditional markets at the time of the research. The double role made the organizational process and supervision less effective. Therefore, the revitalisation process was launched by the Bantul Regional Government to enhance the effectiveness and efficiency of Mangiran market in terms of financing.

The result further showed that there were some off-site activities during the market day. For example, unofficial motorbike parking was accommodated privately by the local community that used open land as parking spaces for sellers and buyers. This phenomenon prompted people to expand the buying and selling process outside the market zone and closer to the parking zone. The situation added to the problems of surveillance and congestion in the area around the market as presented in figure 3.

Shops, restaurants, and stores were found alongside Srandakan Street and behind the market. The activities of these stores supplemented the permanent market and established an interconnecting urban fabric between the market and surrounding area. The connectivity strengthened the function and importance of the area to the locals. This was observed from the organic expansion of the activity zone during market days. The situation led to the occupation of important urban fabric, specifically the open plot and the streets as presented in figure 4. Moreover, the stores around the unofficial market expansion also became active to support temporary trading activities.

Market revitalisation is a long-term process of saving a building or environment from crisis by changing the tangible and intangible aspects with due consideration for all relevant stakeholders (Konior and Pokojska 2020). Traditional markets with a high intangible value to surrounding environment needs to be revitalised. This is necessary to preserve the intrinsic value, mitigate the damage caused by modernisation, and to continuously develop the market. The four principles of revitalisation in traditional market include physical, management, economic, and social principles (Tambunan 2020). National standard is mostly focused on the first three while the fourth is not explicitly regulated. This shows there is a need for a good development approach to ensure traditional markets do not disappear over time. Moreover, good planning and problem analysis need to be implemented at the beginning of the revitalisation process to improve the sales for market owners. The effort is also necessary to ensure the effectiveness of new facilities introduced in traditional market buildings (Triatmojo and Rengga 2019; Azizah 2016).

The revitalisation process focuses on reconstruction or repair rather than total rebuilding. Moreover, attention needs to be placed on projecting a strong sense of brand heritage due to the inherent dearth of opportunities to take advantage of object-based authenticity. This step is important because authenticity can provide a positive influence on the word-of-mouth recommendation towards an object of tourism (Curran et al. 2018). For example, traditional market in some developed countries has become an object of tourist destination for both citizens and visitors (Prastyawan, Isbandono, and Noviyanti 2020). Furthermore, several revitalisation processes have been implemented in
areas with a strong culture of traditional marketplace to attract tourists in addition to local buyers as observed in Egypt (Yoursy and Mekawi 1998), South Korea (Yi and Gim 2018), and Cyprus (Mısırlısoy 2021).

National standard regulation developed for traditional market in Indonesia is not easily applicable to every existing market even though it is based on a good approach. For example, Mangiran market does not have the space for parking and loading as well as an open green area to fulfil the requirements. This shows that the compliance is not achievable without expanding the size of the market considerably. Meanwhile, a structural expansion, vertically or horizontally, is difficult as confirmed by the findings of previous research that some revitalised traditional markets failed to attract customers because of the need to climb stairs to upper floors, leading to income loss for merchants positioned in these spaces (Azizah 2016; Asma 2016; Nurlaela and Hariani 2017; Anggraini et al. 2017). The option to move the market completely to a new area that has the potential to comply with the stated requirement can also lead to a full disconnection from surrounding area. The suggestion is contrary to the plan of making the market an economic catalyst for the local people and the main absorber of local products from surrounding farms and fields. The movement can also cause a sudden void in urban fabric of the area and disrupt the socio-economic ecosystem. This aspect needs to be significantly considered because Mangiran market has several historical infrastructures.

The pretext of using surrounding area as an extension of the market is a direct violation of the 2021 national standard which requires the market to be self-sufficient in providing facilities to relevant stakeholders as stated in article. This regulation is one of the tools designed to reduce the problem of traffic jams outside the official area (Harjoko and Adianto 2018). The consideration of these issues and limitations showed that Mangiran market could not meet national standard required. However, it is possible to design an alternative revitalisation process considering the strong and already organic relationship between the market and urban fabric, specifically during the peak market day. This can be achieved by connecting the urban fabric potential to the principles of traditional market stated in Badan Standarisasi Nasional (2021).

Urban fabric potential can be used to support Mangiran in order to increase the possibility of compliance with national standard while maintaining the core function of being a traditional market. The process can also lead to cooperation with surrounding area and the establishment of a strong sense of relatedness to the social environment (Hull, Lam, and Vigo 1994; Madanipour 2004). These are required to ensure more positivity and competitiveness as presented in table 2 and 3.

**Table 2.** The effects and consequences of incorporating urban fabric into the strategic function of Mangiran market

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Key function</th>
<th>Effects and consequences</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Local economic strength node</td>
<td>Developing economic chain to surrounding area. Maintaining the status quo of Mangiran in relation to function and location.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Contribution to the regional economy</td>
<td>Concentrating on the development of the market area for merchants, giving the possibility to further expand and restructure the market, establishing better zoning, and circulation. Expansion of the number of markets to absorb new jobs and local merchandise.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Increase job opportunity</td>
<td>Delegating functions such as parking space to urban fabric to provide new job positions in local surroundings.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Provide trading facilities</td>
<td>Distributing the non-essential functions from the needed national standard to provide extra space in the merchant area of the market.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Reference point of price</td>
<td>Maintaining the existing function of Mangiran market.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Increase local revenue</td>
<td>Distributing facilities to develop a more business-minded environment that supports surrounding.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Sustain local culture</td>
<td>Developing a strong relationship between the market and urban fabric to sustain the socio-cultural strength of traditional market in surrounding.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Become the source and end of the informal economy</td>
<td>Maintaining the existing function of Mangiran market.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Source of Public Policymaking</td>
<td>Developing a new approach that provides an opportunity for small-sized markets to comply with national standard requirements for traditional markets by incorporating urban fabric.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 3. The effects and consequences of incorporating urban fabric into Mangiran traditional market’s principles

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Key function</th>
<th>Effects and consequences</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Efficiency</td>
<td>The inclusion of urban fabric will reduce the need for space expansion in the market.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Effectivity</td>
<td>The existing urban fabric with supportive facilities can be absorbed into Mangiran with minimum managerial interference.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Productivity</td>
<td>Urban fabric will develop a better space for merchants during the market days.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Accountability</td>
<td>Stronger managerial staff will be needed, specifically to manage the market's expansion towards urban fabric.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Public interest</td>
<td>The close connection between urban fabric and the market will benefit both community and the market's stakeholders.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Environmental insight</td>
<td>With less budget demand, the revitalisation can concentrate on a more sustainable approach for the market.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Social responsibility</td>
<td>Extending the stakeholders to surrounding community will create a stronger sense of belonging for the neighbourhood.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Public cooperation</td>
<td>The cooperation of all stakeholders will be important. The public interest must be upheld as the priority rather than individual interest, both for the market and surrounding.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The efforts to reopen the connection between traditional market and urban fabric require strong cooperation between the market, stakeholders, and surrounding community. It is also important to understand that not all traditional markets can apply this approach. The suitability of Mangiran is due to the good and functioning urban fabric to support the process when regulated strictly in order to fulfil national standard. Moreover, weekly market day is expected to become the key period to include urban fabric due to the market expansion.

The space requirements were observed to be fulfilled during the regular day because only a few merchants were present. This made it possible to have an appropriate space ratio for parking and loading dock to satisfy their needs. However, on market day, the number of merchants increased exponentially and the space became less ideal, leading to organic expansion towards the backside and the streets. The phenomenon showed that surrounding urban fabric, mainly the plot, open space, and streets, had a high potential to become an alternate periodical space for expansion during the market day.

Periodical street markets do not permanently disrupt the activities of the locals and also allow the participation in renting spaces to periodical merchants. This showed that Mangiran could redistribute permanent merchants into a more condensed space by demolishing the part without heritage buildings in order to adhere to the need for green open space in traditional market. The effort would be better than expanding the market only to cover the spaces needed on periodic market days. The new green open space in the market can serve a secondary function in line with the second hypothesis of this research.

Traditional market is not self-sustainable without subsidy from the government because of the low rent fee charged. This business model cannot compete with modern and digital markets. Therefore, some functions need to be included to increase the income. For example, traditional market has become one of the focus of tourism (Curran et al. 2018; Zandieh and Seifpour 2020) and this showed that the potential of Mangiran should be developed further for this purpose during the revitalisation process. Therefore, the alternative approach proposed is presented in the following figure 5.

Figure 5. Mangiran market and expansion area on surrounding urban fabric during market day

The revitalisation process provides a rebranding opportunity for the market in addition to the inclusion of a tourism aspect to attract new types of customers (Noaime et al. 2022). The weekly market day also allows the presence of different merchants during the non-market day in order to provide diversity without reducing the space for the current types of products being sold. This effort can reduce the risk of losing the
function of the marketplace in absorbing local products. Moreover, Mangiran market has several advantages that can be included in a marketing mix, such as the inclusion of endogenous products from surrounding farm fields and the heritage elements in the area. It is also located on the main commercial road between the airport and the city centre. The potential can attract new consumers and tourists when developed correctly. However, the development should be conducted without eliminating the essence of traditional market as observed during the revitalisation process. The alternative approach was considered feasible for Mangiran through the development of the hybrid traditional market with the capacity to generate sufficient income for self-sustainability.

Conclusion

In conclusion, the revitalisation process of Mangiran market was intended to focus on both the repair of physical damage and compliance with the Indonesian national standard. However, limited space and government funding as well as the lack of ability to generate high capital return made the compliance process difficult. This problem led to the development of an alternative approach to fulfil the requirements with due consideration for the urban fabric potential and existing surrounding area. New functions were formulated with a focus on tourism through the careful insertion of urban fabric. This was proposed to have strict management and a balanced function without neglecting the sociocultural and economic contribution of the market to the surrounding area. Meanwhile, the hypothesis was found to be applicable to Mangiran market but not recommended for the other traditional markets due to the differences in the uniqueness of the relationship with surrounding urban fabric. Close cooperation was also suggested to exist between the stakeholders and social surrounding area to ensure a good relationship between the market and urban fabric.

References


The integration of urban fabric potential in the development of Mangiran Market to Fulfil the Indonesian traditional market standard project

Nicolaus Nino Ardiansyah, Trias Mahendarto, Agnes Gracia Quita


Author(s) contribution
Nicolaus Nino Ardiansyah contributed to the research concepts preparation, methodologies, investigations, data analysis, visualization, and revisions.

Trias Mahendarto contributed to the research concepts preparation and literature reviews, data analysis, of article drafts preparation and validation.

Agnes Gracia Quita contributed to the research concepts preparation and literature reviews, data analysis, of article drafts preparation and validation.